

# 2017

## Institutionalizing Community Engagement for Urban Sanitation: Towards a Transformative and Sustainable Model

Jaipur



**Institute of Development Studies Jaipur**  
(Supported by ICSSR, New Delhi)



# **Institutionalizing Community Engagement for Urban Sanitation: Towards a Transformative and Sustainable Model**

## **Jaipur**

**Research Team IDSJ**

Shobhita Rajagopal, Kanchan Mathur, Radheyshyam Sharma

**With**

Vasudha Chakravarthy(Development Solutions, Jaipur)



**Institute of Development Studies Jaipur**  
**September 2017**

## Abbreviations and Glossary

CMHO: Chief Medical and Health Officer

CMAR: City Managers Association Rajasthan

DLB: Directorate of Local Bodies

D W&CD: Department of Women and Child Development

ICDS: Integrated Child Development Programme

JMC: Jaipur Municipal Corporation

MAS: Mahila Arogya Samiti.

NUHM: National Urban Health Mission

PHED: Public Health and Engineering Department

SBA/SBM: Swachh Bharat Abhiyan/ Mission

### **Glossary**

*Basti*: Colony

*Chabootra*: Platform

*Nala*: Drain

*Parshad*: Councillor

Sahayogini: Friend

## Acknowledgement

This mid-line assessment has been made possible with the support and help of large number individuals within urban communities of Jaipur, officials of Municipal Corporation of Jaipur and CFAR. We are grateful to all the members of Daksha Samooh, adolescent girls' groups as well as men and boys of Jhalana Kunda, Soot Mill Colony, Sitaram Nagar and Parvat Colony for sparing time and sharing their experiences, struggles and challenges on issues of Urban Sanitation.

We wish to thank all the officials of Jaipur Municipal Corporation, National Urban Health Mission, Rajasthan and Directorate of the Local Bodies for sparing time and giving us an insight into government processes and perspective on issues related to Urban Sanitation in Jaipur.

The constant support provided by the CFAR team at all levels in facilitating community and government interactions is gratefully acknowledged.

We would like to put on record our deep appreciation for all the research support and inputs provided by Ms. Mukta Gupta (Freelance Researcher, Jaipur) at all stages of the study.

Finally, we are grateful to CFAR, New Delhi for giving us this opportunity to undertake the mid line assessment of the project 'Aligning with National Programmes and Policies on Sanitation: Enhancing Community Engagement and Demand Generation in Jaipur.

**Shobhita Rajagopal, Kanchan Mathur, Radhayshyam Sharma**  
Institute of Development Studies, Jaipur

## Executive Summary

The project 'Aligning with National Programmes and Policies on Sanitation: Enhancing Community Engagement and Demand Generation' being implemented by CFAR focuses on deepening community engagement and generating demand on issues pertaining to urban sanitation by addressing the extensive problems faced by women, men and children in underserved urban settlements and habitats.

The thrust of the current WSH (water, sanitation, hygiene) interventions is on making all sanitation priorities, services and solutions, gender and community responsive by placing the unmet needs of the vulnerable and the least served populations at the core of the interventions. The approach is to leverage the mandate of SBA by bringing providers and users into constant dialogue in pursuit of common action.

The mid-line assessment study attempts to understand the potential breakthroughs made and the challenges faced during the course of the intervention to strengthen access to services, facilities and schemes in Jaipur. The specific objective of the study is to arrive at a studied approach/model to community strengthening and engagement in the context of marginalised communities and urban sanitation by situating the multiple linkages for furthering policy advocacy and future programming especially in the context of SBA.

This qualitative mid-line assessment was undertaken in the city of Jaipur, in the months of June-July 2017 and covered four urban settlements Jhalana Kunda and Soot Mill Colony where the Women's Forums are evolved and at a mature stage and; Parvat Colony and Sitaram Nagar where the Women's Forums are at a nascent stage.

The assessment has used tools like participatory focus group discussions (FGDs) and key informant interviews to understand the context, the intervention processes and the processes of change both at the individual and community level in the selected intervention locations.

The intervention in Jaipur extends to 13 urban slums covering 5085 households and a population of 25470 persons. Out of the seven *bastis* which were selected in the first phase, three have been retained and 10 new intervention areas have been added in the current phase of the project. These include Soot Mill Colony, Jhalana Kunda, Indira Nagar, RIICCO Basti, Parvat Colony, Sitaram Nagar I and II, J.P Colony, Jawahar Nagar Tila 3 and 4, Nagtalai North and South and Bapu Basti.

### Key Findings

- Building women's collectives and forums in each intervention area has been a key focus in the project. In Jaipur, the emergence of Daksha Samooh, a collective of women's forums, forum of adolescent girls and men and youth groups have helped in raising critical concerns and negotiating for services with local government officials.
- The Daksha Samooh has an Executive committee of 23 members and a total of 99 members with representation from each Woman's Forum at the community level. There has been a regular focus by CFAR on capacity building of Daksha Samooh members. The training at Bikaner in building twin pit toilets and the subsequent construction of a large number of individual toilets in households has been one of the greatest achievements. The Daksha Samooh also addresses issues of entitlements and violence. The women first try and sort issues related to domestic violence at their own level. If they do not succeed they approach the Mahila Suraksha Kendra, Mahila Thana or Aparajita Kendra, the one-stop crisis centre.

- The women's forum in each of the colonies has been taking up issues related to toilets, open drains, PDS, water supply and garbage collection.
- In Jhalana Kunda, 665 applications have been submitted to JMC for building twin pit toilets under the SBA scheme with the help of the women's forum. As many as 234 households have received both the installments (Rs 4000/- after submission of the form and Rs.4000/- after completion and photo validation. *The forum helped in creating awareness and assisted people in filling forms and collecting the necessary documents. According to a member of the women's forum (Jhalana Kunda): "The Nigam could not have been successful in getting the forms filled or the toilets made if the women's forum had not helped".* Similarly, in Soot Mill Colony in addition to construction of toilets, the women's forum has been able to negotiate with the government to construct a Community Toilet Complex. The inspection was carried out and pre fabricated toilets have been installed recently. The members of the women's forums have also been appointed as *Swachhta Grahis* under SBM.
- In all the four colonies, the women's forum raised the issue of water supply with the concerned authorities and has been able to ensure regular supply of water. Similarly, the issue of drainage has also been addressed in the respective colonies. The members of the women's forum have taken the initiative to construct small drains and soak pit to prevent water logging in the lanes.
- The collection and disposal of garbage has been streamlined with the Intervention of the women's forums in all the four areas. The use of dustbins and segregation of waste has been initiated. The regularity of municipal workers has also been ensured through regular monitoring by the women's group.
- CFAR has also enabled the formation of adolescent girls' groups Kishori Sambal Samooh. This forum has provided a platform for girls to come together and discuss a range of issues education, health, sanitation and livelihood. The girls are vocal and can discuss issues related to menstruation with family members as well as boys. All girls use sanitary pads. They do not throw the pads in the open but wrap them in paper and throw them in the garbage bin. In most of the homes, the taboos attached to menstruation i.e. not entering the kitchen, eating separately etc., have reduced considerably.
- In all the intervention areas, efforts have been made to involve men and boys in various activities. They are aware of the initiatives undertaken by the women's forums on WSH issues including construction of IHHL toilets. The masons who have been trained by CFAR are helping others in the construction of these toilets which in turn is providing momentum to SBA scheme of the government.
- Other platforms like public hearings and knowledge camps have also helped in facilitating interface with government officials and in gaining new information.
- Government officials from JMC, NUHM and DLB appreciated the efforts made by CFAR in raising awareness and helping in changing sanitation practices in the concerned areas. According to them: *CFAR had helped in verifying applications; monitored the construction of toilets and helped upload the photos of constructed toilets so that the second installment could be disbursed to the families in Jhalana Kunda. Similar efforts by the CFAR team in other bastis would be immensely helpful in furthering the mandate of the SBM (JMC official).*
- The assessment indicates that processes initiated by CFAR have been well received and the mature groups have taken up many issues. There is evidence of strong leadership among

women who acknowledge that they have gained knowledge and experience by being part of the forums.

### Way Forward

- CFAR's recent initiative of establishing a 'Single Window as a platform for convergence between community and government' is a positive step as it envisages convergence of all the stakeholders. Once implemented, this needs to be monitored closely.
- In-depth and extensive engagement with women's forums in new areas that are at a nascent stage is required. Regular visits and handholding by members of the Daksha Samooh and mature groups members can help in strengthening these groups.
- Systematic training and capacity building of members of women's forums on gender issues is essential. This is necessary to understand the different dimensions of gender subordination and its relation to access to resources and entitlements.
- The demand for literacy centers raised by women in various colonies should be addressed by making the necessary linkages with concerned departments. The involvement of men and boys in the intervention areas is an aspect that needs to be strengthened. This will also help dispel the perception that urban sanitation was a "women's issue".
- While a good rapport has been established by CFAR with various government officials at the field level, it would be helpful if senior officials in the JMC, DLB and NUHM can be engaged. This would also help in streamlining convergence between these agencies and enable coordinated efforts.
- Gender training of CFAR personnel on linkages between urban sanitation and gender emerges as a critical area.
- The Community Score Card developed by CFAR is a positive intervention. However, the purpose of rating and its outcomes needs to be clearly understood by CFAR team as well as the community women and men.
- Finally, CFAR needs to discuss the withdrawal strategy both within the organization and in the communities in which they are working so that appropriate mechanisms can be put in place at the community level.



# Institutionalizing Community Engagement for Urban Sanitation: Towards a Transformative and Sustainable Model

## Introduction

Sanitation has been in focus at the national policy and programme level since 2015. Making the country open-defecation free by 2019 has been accorded a high priority by the government. As part of the *Swachh Bharat Abhiyan* (SBA), access to sanitation facilities and services are being seen as a critical development goal at the national, state and district levels.

A three-year intervention on sanitation, water and hygiene (WSH) named “Sanitation, Water and Hygiene-Strengthening Community-centred and Gender-responsive Provisioning” was implemented by the Centre for Advocacy and Research (CFAR) in 2012 in three cities of Delhi, Jaipur and Kolkata with support from Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation. The end-term evaluation report of Phase 1 of the project notes that the intervention was not only successful in generating awareness on issues concerning water, sanitation and hygiene; it also enabled women to emerge as community leaders who could identify needs and articulate their WSH concerns/demands across various platforms. The intervention helped in building partnerships with several government organizations /departments to leverage their support in ensuring basic services (IHD/CFAR, 2017).

Subsequently, through its project 'Aligning with National Programmes and Policies on Sanitation: Enhancing Community Engagement and Demand Generation', CFAR has been involved in deepening community engagement and generating demand on issues pertaining to urban sanitation by addressing the extensive problems faced by women, men and children in underserved urban settlements and habitats in cities of Delhi, Kolkata, Jaipur, Kota and Jodhpur

The thrust of the current WSH interventions being implemented in five cities is on making all sanitation priorities, services and solutions, gender and community responsive. Unmet needs of the vulnerable and least served populations are at the core of the interventions. The approach is to leverage the mandate of SBA by bringing providers and users into constant dialogue in pursuit of common action for the benefit of underserved settlements.

It is evident that sanitation issues are closely related to cultural practices, attitudes and values are highly gendered, and need to be addressed at various levels. The community engagement processes rolled out by CFAR has focused on mobilizing women and collectivizing them. These Women's Forums, as the collectives are called, have been engaging with the multiple stakeholders. A series of public hearings were held in the intervention areas in Jaipur during January-February, 2017. The public hearings facilitated in providing a common platform where community members presented their concerns, needs and priorities around issues pertaining to water, roads, toilets, drainage and sewerage systems, garbage collection and disposal and public safety.

This mid-line assessment attempts to understand the potential breakthroughs that were made and the challenges faced during the course of the intervention to strengthen access to services, facilities and schemes in Jaipur.

The specific objective of the study is to arrive at a studied approach/model to community strengthening and engagement in the context of marginalised communities and urban sanitation by situating the multiple linkages for furthering policy advocacy and future programming especially in the context of SBA.

## **Key research questions**

The key questions addressed during the assessment are:

### **Role and Functioning of Community Platforms**

- What is the role and functioning of the women's forums and Daksha Samooh? What are the challenges faced by them in mobilizing and engaging community women and men?
- What is the process of forming a women's forum and how are the responsibilities assigned? Which men and women, are part of the committee? What processes are used to resolve conflicts? What are the successes and failures?
- How effective are the various platforms in ensuring regularity of services? What are the challenges faced in the interactions between community and the service providers?
- What were the processes that enabled the partnership with Jaipur Municipal Corporation (JMC), Directorate of Local bodies (DLB) and National Urban Health Mission (NUHM)? How are the Plans of Action that emerged from the baseline study and public hearings being advanced?
- Are officials willing to engage with the priorities of the community in a sensitive manner?
- What is the nature of response to concerns articulated during the public hearings? Is there a differential response on different components?
- Are the community platforms and structures effective in influencing the quality of response?
- Do the representatives of the community have the capability to manage, facilitate, educate and motivate their peers and community?
- What inputs are required to strengthen the community engagement processes? And from whom?

### **Perception on the role of men and boys**

- What are the strategies used for ensuring male participation? What are the challenges faced in mobilizing them?
- How do men perceive and articulate their concerns around sanitation?
- Are there any cases of proactive participation of men?

### **Behaviour change at Individual and community level**

- What is the nature of behavior change? Is there a gender difference?
- How many women and men have constructed toilets within their homes; how many are dependent on public toilets; how many still do not have accessible facilities?
- What are the barriers and how are they being addressed?
- Is the process of change sustainable? Has it been facilitated appropriately? Is there enough participation, representation and ownership? How is ownership defined?

## Approach and Methodology

This qualitative study was undertaken in the city of Jaipur, in the months of June- July 2017 and covered four urban settlements. The final selection of the settlements was carried out in consultation with the CFAR team:

- Two settlements, Jhalana Kunda and Soot Mill Colony, were selected where the women's forums are evolved and at a mature stage
- Two settlements Parvat Colony and Sitaram Nagar where the women's forums are at a nascent stage were also covered

The study has focused on understanding perspectives of all relevant stakeholders. A desk-review of project related documents, including the project plans, baseline data, reports of training and meetings, reports of public hearings, resolutions/orders, media reports and other documentary films generated through the project helped in locating and understanding the intervention and its processes. The review also helped in developing the tools for the study.

This qualitative study has used participatory focus group discussions and key informant interviews to understand the context, the intervention processes and the processes of change both at the individual and community level in selected intervention locations. The response of the service providers and action taken by them were ascertained through detailed interviews. Observation of meetings and discussions helped capture both the aspirations and issues of dissatisfaction among community stakeholders (women and men and adolescent boys and girls).

Based on the findings, the study attempts to arrive at a model for institutionalizing community engagement in urban sanitation that can help in addressing gaps as well as collectively arrive at solutions in consultation with government. It would also serve as a case for policy advocacy in the context of the *Swachh Bharat Abhiyan*.

The report is divided into five sections. Section I presents the background of the project and the beginnings of community engagement on urban sanitation in the selected intervention areas of CFAR. Section II analyses the approach taken by CFAR in initiating community processes; Section III presents the perspectives of the various government officials on enabling partnerships; Section IV focuses on the gains and challenges of community engagement in CFAR intervention areas and sustainability concerns and the concluding section presents some suggestions and way forward.

## Section I

### Community engagement in WSH: The Beginnings

The Centre for Advocacy and Research has been working in urban areas of Jaipur city since 2006. The initial focus was on strengthening access of urban poor and marginalized communities in three slums to basic entitlements, thereby enabling them to lead a life of dignity. Since 2012, CFAR focused on water, sanitation and hygiene through its three-year project, "Sanitation, Water and Hygiene: Strengthening community centred and Gender responsive provisioning". The project primarily focused on awareness building to empower vulnerable poor women to claim their hygiene and sanitation rights independently by themselves or through a group approach. The interventions were mainly geared towards identifying gaps in awareness on sanitation, water and hygiene and bringing about a change in practise. The locations where the interventions were implemented were urban poor slum clusters and unauthorized settlements that have remained underserved in terms of public provisioning. The CFAR intervention, therefore, focused on a wide variety of issues and concerns that affect the community, including those of sanitation, water and hygiene. Multiple strategies were used by CFAR. Community engagement was facilitated by forming women's groups and conducting activities such as camps, distribution of IEC materials, public meetings etc. All these engagements helped in gaining confidence and trust of the community. The intervention also sought to identify change agents and leaders who could strengthen the collective understanding and lead to informed demand generation (IHD, 2017).

The project implemented in 2012, covered seven urban settlements in Jaipur city where CFAR began working on issues such as water quality and storage, sanitation, garbage collection and disposal and personal and menstrual hygiene. The formal community involvement was facilitated through women's forums and forums of adolescent girls and youth. As many as 14 forums were formed and are currently active in Jhalana Kunda, Soot Mill Colony, J.P. Colony, Ambedkar Nagar, Baba Ramdev Nagar, Brijlal Pura and Rajiv Nagar. CFAR took on capacity building of community members so that they are able to demand for better services and their rights. Extensive interactions and discussions were held among forum members on menstrual hygiene management, hand washing practices, water management, proper disposal of waste, use and disposal of sanitary napkin, reproductive health, construction and use of toilets to reduce open defecation.

The constant demand from active adolescent groups led to partnerships wherein young girls could have access to better services, in-depth information and livelihood opportunities. On this, the CFAR team engaged with NRHM and advocated intensively that girls in urban areas should also be covered under the free sanitary napkin distribution scheme of the state government. Consequently, urban girls were included under the UDAAN scheme.

**CFAR also worked at multiple levels to crystallize** the demands of the community and use programmatic spaces and opportunities to partner with the government to enable responsiveness towards the needs of the urban poor. CFAR has continuously engaged and networked with nodal departments like - Department of Women Empowerment, Department of Education, Jaipur Municipal Corporation, Department of Health and Nutrition and State/National level programmes like National Urban Health Mission and *Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan*. The end line report of the intervention notes that in Jaipur, CFAR generated awareness in the intervention areas on the harmful effects of open defecation, disposal of children's excreta in open spaces, importance of personal toilets, the need for purifying water, health problems and menstrual hygiene. CFAR identified a space for formal community involvement by creating a support group at the field level.

CFAR also established partnerships with the department of health and the NUHM and this led to the health department adopting the slum based women's forum under the *Mahila Arogya Samiti* (MAS). The members of MAS actively participated in various campaigns and reached out to a large number of children during the polio campaign. CFAR also collaborated with the department for providing training on hygiene, health, sanitation and related issues to the MAS members (IHD, 2017)

One of the significant interventions facilitated by CFAR was the construction of two pit toilets in collaboration with the Jaipur Municipal Corporation. CFAR facilitated a field visit for community members to Bikaner where they were given information and exposure on the construction and use of twin pit toilets. A twin pit toilet consists of two deep pits which are used one after the other and can be constructed at lower costs with local materials. One pit has a working life of five years for a family of five members. On returning from the visit many members decided to construct toilets in their homes. CFAR provided technical support and with the launch of SBM in 2014, CFAR the forum in linking them with the scheme. A total of 630 toilets have been constructed in Jhalana Kunda and around 350 in Soot Mill Colony (ibid).

Discussions with CFAR team members in Jaipur highlighted that in the first phase the focus was on awareness building on WSH issues. Now, the focus is on strengthening the processes of community engagement and ensuring sustainability.

According to Hemlata, one of the older team members of CFAR: "*The initial work in the bastis focussed on issue of entitlements including systematizing the PDS. Subsequently, issues related to sanitation and garbage disposal were taken up. A woman's forum called the Jagriti Mahila Manch was also formed. Some of the women who were more vocal and enthusiastic went on to form the Daksha Samooh in 2009. In 2012 CFAR started working in seven bastis where intensive work was most needed. Women's forums as well as adolescent forums were formed and they were given training on issues concerning WSH. The first training on twin pit toilets was organised in Bikaner in 2013. Today, the women's forum handles social issues as well as problems related to WSH. Orientation and exposure to various government departments and organizations is done from time to time*".

In 2016 the project 'Aligning with National Programmes and Policies on Sanitation: Enhancing Community Engagement and Demand Generation' was initiated in Jaipur along with other cities. The main focus was on deepening community engagement and generating demand on issues pertaining to urban sanitation.

This intervention in Jaipur extends across 13 urban slums covering 5085 households and a population of 25470. Of the seven *bastis* which were selected in the first phase, three have been retained and 10 new intervention areas have been added in the current phase of the project. These include Soot Mill Colony, Jhalana Kunda, Indira Nagar, RIICO Basti, Parvat Colony, Sitaram Nagar I and II, J.P Colony, Jawahar Nagar Tila 3 and 4, Nagtalai North and South and Bapu Basti. Interventions have also been initiated in the cities of Kota and Jodhpur.

Discussions with the CFAR team revealed that the current project has focused on construction of Individual household latrines (IHHL), solid waste management with an emphasis on technical training on waste management i.e. Installation of dustbins, segregation of garbage at source, building compost units and recycling units, ensuring provision of open depots. Some of the key activities that have been undertaken in the project are:

- Training on twin-pit toilet technique for community members, masons, *Mahila Arogya Samiti* members and NULM Federation members
- Sensitization and orientation of 411 Engineers, Junior Engineers, Executive and Revenue Officials of all the Urban Local Bodies (ULB) on community engagement and participation
- Strengthening convergence through 33 toilet subsidy processing camps for 3215 persons in Jaipur, 1080 in Jodhpur and 349 in Kota; of the 4295 toilets constructed, 3693 on-site verification were conducted by ULB officials
- Organizing nine Knowledge Camps on Solid Waste Management (SWM) for 595 households which are tracked by 49 forum representatives through door to door visits and community meetings.
- Development of communication material on IHHL. This was later printed for dissemination by JMC.

## Section II

### Approach and Process of Community Engagement

The approach to community engagement in Jaipur has taken into account the heterogeneity of the populations residing in the underserved areas. Many of the residents are migrants and are involved in low income activities. The living spaces are congested and services and infrastructure poor. Women are largely involved in household activities and lead restrictive lives. In addition to experiencing their own personal needs for WSH, women shoulder responsibility for the WSH needs of their family members. Ensuring family wellbeing, health and hygiene are looked upon as a woman's responsibility. The burden of this responsibility is immensely heavier in households and communities without clean, safe, accessible and affordable water and toilets. In addition, the issues of sanitation and clean surroundings has largely been on the margins and rarely debated or discussed. In some areas the issue is closely intertwined with local politics.

#### **The Approach**

Since 2012, CFAR has worked on the premise that building local leadership within the intervention areas is necessary to address the multiple issues related to urban sanitation. Building women's collectives and forums in each area has been a central focus. In Jaipur, the emergence of Daksha Samooh, the women's forums, forum of adolescent girls besides, men and youth groups have helped in raising critical concerns and negotiating for services with local government officials. The other platforms that have emerged are public hearings and knowledge camps for sharing information on WSH issues.

#### **Functioning of the Women's Forums**

##### *Emergence of Daksha Samooh*

Daksha Samooh was established in 2009 with the help of CFAR. It was formed based on the idea that collective action was essential if women in poor communities were to find solutions for the multiple problems they faced. Besides, it was important that communities themselves came forward with the solutions. Cross learning was seen as essential ingredient for the progress of the community. Hence, a forum which had representation from each locality and space for articulation of concerns and finding solutions, was promoted.

The Daksha Samooh has an executive committee of 23 members and a total of 99 members with representation from each Women's Forum at the community level. They meet every month at the CFAR office or in any one of the *bastis*. The meetings are recorded. There has been a regular focus by CFAR on capacity building of Daksha Samooh members. One of its most notable achievements has been the training workshop held in Bikaner in the construction of twin-pit latrines and the subsequent construction of individual toilets by a large number of households. Knowledge camps are also organised by CFAR with the help of Daksha Samooh in the *bastis*. The members of the Daksha Samooh also address issue of domestic violence. The Samooh members try to resolve complaints arising from family discord, marital disagreement, alcohol abuse and violence against a woman in a household through counselling of the accused and the complainant.. If the problem is not resolved, they approach the Mahila Suraksha Kendra, Mahila Thana and in case necessary, Aparajita Kendra, the one-stop crisis centre.

## *Jagriti Mahila Samooh*

The Jagriti Mahila Samooh has been established in each of the intervention areas covered during this assessment-Jhalana Kunda, Soot Mill Colony, Parvat Colony and Sitaram Nagar. Forums were established in each of these localities, when communities were not able to resolve a problem at the individual level.

*In Jhalana Kunda, the forum was established in 2012 when the women came together to demand for a drain to be cleaned. The drain had not been cleaned in years. The accumulated garbage was a breeding ground of diseases. However, it was beyond the power of a single individual to persuade the municipal authorities to do the job. As a group, they were more confident and with the help of CFAR team they put in applications at the Nagar Nigam office. Now the drain is cleaned every year in the month of July. It has come into the 'system' and they no longer have to put in applications at the Nagar Nigam.*

The success achieved by the collective in resolving this issue gave the women courage and confidence to take up other issues as well. The strength of the collective was established again when a *pucca* road was being made. The contractor who was paving the main road refused to pave the lanes of the *basti* saying it was impossible for their equipment and machines to enter the narrow lanes. The women got together, asked for the materials needed for making the road and with the help of male members as well as the adolescents' group, were able to make *pucca* lanes in the *basti*.

*At the focus group discussions, the women recalled a similar experience in Soot Mill Colony*

*"In 2007, the problem of the ration/PDS supply was acute in our area. The ration shopkeeper refused to give kerosene to the women. Gas connections were not common then and not all households had electricity connection. Kerosene was needed for cooking as well as lighting purposes. To tackle this problem, we decided to form a group and visited the government office. With the help of Hemlata (from CFAR) we were able to report the matter to the official. The next day an official visited the *basti* but the shopkeeper shut the shop and ran away. Subsequently, the shop keeper not only gave the kerosene that due to us but also returned the extra money that he had been charging us till then. This was our first victory and since then there has been no looking back".*

Today, the forums in Soot Mill Colony as well as in Jhalana Kunda have come of age. They not only resolve issues related to water, sanitation and hygiene but are also taking up other social issues such as domestic violence. They are also equipped with information and know where and who to approach to get a birth certificate, pension card, Aadhar card etc.

The women's forums in Parvat Colony as well as Sitaram Nagar where CFAR has just begun work, are relatively new. However, the women were confident and vocal. They were able to discuss various issues and seemed to realise the importance of collective work.

Focus Group Discussion with the women's forum in Parvat Colony gave an insight into the origins of this forum.

*"There is a huge pit in the colony which has become a dumping ground for all kinds of trash and garbage. Stagnant water collects in it throughout the year and overflows when it rains. It emits a bad odour and is a breeding ground for diseases. Residents of the colony were unable to come up with any solution to get it cleaned. In February 2017, there was a Jan Sunwai (public hearing) in Nagtalai which was also attended by the Parshad (Councillor). Women of this colony participated in the public hearing and voiced their problem. However, no action was taken and the women were very disappointed. When CFAR workers visited the colony, and discussed the idea of forming a collective with the women, the Jagriti Mahila Manch was formed. It had 16 members to begin with. The members of the group visited each house to encourage women to join the forum. They also created awareness about cleanliness and hygiene. No government official had visited their*



colony before the women's forum was formed. Today, due to the pressure of the forum government officials have begun visiting the area and listening to their grievances”.

However, according to the members, the issue of the pit has not been resolved completely. The garbage from the pit was taken out but has been left piled outside the pit. It was supposed to be taken away by the Nagar Nigam, but no action had been taken. Leftover food from restaurants was also thrown in the pit. Phoolwati, the leader of the forum said, “If we in the colony start keeping our premises clean, then maybe those people will also stop dumping their garbage here.”

### **Gaining an identity outside their community**

The women's forum has not only been active in their own basti, but has also been approached by the Nigam to help create awareness in the nearby RIICO basti. The forum visited the basti, met the community members and discussed as to how the toilets can be made and helped in identifying the space for constructing the toilets. The community arrived at a solution collectively. They decided that the problem could be solved by connecting the basti to the main sewer line situated close by. They filed an application in the Nigam. An inspection was carried out and a sewer line has been laid.

Some of the achievements of the women's forum include:

### **Construction of Toilets**

- In Jhalana Kunda, out of 913 households in this basti, 665 applications have been submitted for building twin pit toilets under the SBA scheme. 234 households have received both the instalments (Rs 4000/- after submission of form and Rs.4000/- after completion and validation of toilet).
- The JMC, through a letter dated January 9, 2017, instructed the Deputy Commissioners of various zones in Jaipur city to appoint Swachhta Grahis in various wards as per the list provided by CFAR. One of the Forum members Anju, in Soot Mill Colony is a Swachhta Grahi of SBM. Her tasks included verifying applications for construction of individual household toilets and uploading applications. She also monitors the construction of toilets and attends the meetings of SBM in the wards.
- In Soot Mill Colony, out of 450 households, 350 households have their own twin-pit toilet. The SBA does not give money to tenants for building toilets. Hence, the women's forum, with the help of CFAR has been able to negotiate with the government to construct CT Complex (Community Toilet Complex). Six seat pre-fabricated toilets, connected to the sewer line have been provided.

### **Drainage**

- In Jhalana Kunda, the women's forum members have also been able to make their lanes 'pucca' with the help of materials provided by the Nagar Nigam. They have also constructed small drains in front of their house for water to flow. The individual households have also taken the responsibility of keeping the drains clean.
- In Soot Mill Colony there were no 'pucca' drains or outlets for bathing and this led to water logging in front of the houses. The residents then came up with a solution and built a 20-foot soak pit in front of each house. They covered it and a slab of stone, so it looks like a 'chabootra'. The water drains into that. Now the problem arises only when it rains.

## Water

In Soot Mill Colony the women's forum has been successful in getting a water connection for each 'mohalla'. They collected money from each household and bought the necessary pipes and motor pumps. They contributed labour and now there are about eight common taps in the basti, roughly one in each lane. Some of the homes also have their own taps.

- In Jhalana Kunda, women addressed the problem of inadequate water supply and poor quality of water. They submitted an application to the PHED and vigorously followed it up. As a result, two tube wells were installed, connected to the water tank in the cluster. There are several taps in these water tanks and people can easily fill water. This has reduced the fights for water in this cluster.
- In Sitaram Nagar the women's forum took up the issue of water shortage and low water pressure in households that are located higher up on a slope. The water supply is erratic. The women wrote an application and met the JEN and apprised him of their problems. The official has given assurance that the pump will be repaired.

## Collection of Garbage and Disposal

- In Jhalana Kunda the women have been successful in negotiating with the Nagar Nigam to send their van for garbage collection every 4-5 days.

In Soot Mill cluster, residents used to dispose their garbage in open plots or on the railway track. The women visited the municipal officer several times with the problem but when no action was taken, the women's group went to the municipal zone office and submitted a written complaint. As a result, the municipality placed a community dustbin in the cluster. Once the dustbin was placed, it was regularly used by the people of the cluster but was never cleaned. So again the women lodged a complaint. Now the dustbin is cleaned regularly. As no sanitation workers are deployed in the cluster for cleaning the streets and drains, every household cleans the road in front of the house and disposes the garbage in the community dustbin. Members of the youth group and women's group alternately clean the drains every fifteen days (IHD-2017)

### Preventing Dumping of Hospital Waste

“The issue of dumping hospital waste was taken up by the women’s group in Jhalana Kunda. Every day, a van filled with waste from a hospital nearby dumped its contents in the basti. This included dressings soiled with blood, broken syringes, vials of medicines etc. It was becoming a major source of infection. To put an end to this, the women approached the concerned officials at the Nagar Nigam and spoke to the Councillor. But nothing came of it. They even approached the driver of the van, requesting him to change his route, but it had no effect. They then decided to take matters in their own hands. They called for a meeting and decided on a collective action. The next day, 30-35 women blocked the path of the van. The van driver turned the van and drove back. The following day, the contractor came and warned the women not to interfere and threatened that the van would continue to pass through the basti. The driver changed his timings to when he knew the women would be busy at home. This did not deter the women who came up with a counter strategy. They blocked the road with rocks and wires etc. Now it’s been 8-10 days, the van has not come back.”

As reported by Maya during FGD, Jhalana Kunda, June 2017

## FSSM

The discussions with members of Daksha Samooh and MAS in Jaipur revealed that women had a

basic understanding of the need for safe treatment of faecal sludge. They were aware that dumping of untreated faecal waste was harmful and could lead to diseases and ill health. They suggested that in the twin-pit system the waste can be used as manure after treatment.

The forum leader informed that they had started talking about *Mal Niptan*/ FSSM in their meetings. They had also created a slogan

*Surakshit* toilets *banana hai*, *Asurakshit* toilets *Ghatanahai* (We need to increase safe toilets and reduce unsafe toilets)

She also pointed out that they had been demanding that sewerage connection be given in their respective areas by JMC.

The issues taken up by the forums as well as the challenges faced by them have been more or less similar in all the four colonies. Initially the women in all these colonies had to face resistance by male members as well as other women. This reduced considerably when results of their work became visible. Similarly, attending meetings as well as completing household tasks was not easy earlier, but now the women have become quite adept at it.

The women's forum members in the four colonies stated that a lot of work has been done on the WSH issues. The changes are visible in the two colonies where the women's forums have been working for some time. Each member seems to understand all the aspects related to sanitation and health. They are also creating awareness about garbage segregation and solid waste management among the communities.

Women as well as community members have come to realise the importance of clean drinking water. There is greater awareness about the importance of education. The children from these colonies go to school and some of the women have made an effort to complete their secondary schooling through Open Distance Learning. Phoranti Devi of Sitaram Nagar is a leading example. She has passed class X by enrolling in the state open school and is motivating other girls/women dropouts to do the same.

### **Engaging with Adolescent Girls:**

In addition to women's forums, CFAR has also enabled the formation of adolescent girls' groups Kishori Sambal Samooh. This forum has provided a platform for girls to come together and discuss a range of issues education, health, sanitation and livelihood.

The adolescents' girls group was formed in 2012 in Jhalana Kunda to create awareness on various issues like nutrition, sanitation, and cleanliness and personal hygiene as well as of their surroundings, menstrual hygiene and child marriage. There are about 15 members in this group who participate in various activities. None of the girls in the group are married.

The girls are vocal and can discuss issues related to menstruation with family members as well as boys. All girls use sanitary pads. In most of the homes, the taboos attached to menstruation i.e. not entering the kitchen, eating separately etc has reduced considerably.

The girls said that *they encountered such taboos when they went to their villages. "We try and talk about it to our older relatives and create awareness among them"*. In their own community, they have tried to create awareness on issues pertaining to MHM, garbage disposal, and sanitation.

The adolescent girls' group in Soot Mill Colony has also been active about creating awareness on sanitation and cleanliness. The members of the group said they were not aware about maintaining menstrual hygiene during periods. Many girls were also using cloth as absorbents. The girls openly

spoke about the fact no one in the family or in the school had discussed issues related to onset of menstruation. There have been instances when even the teacher did not want to discuss what was “wrong” with if they started menstruating in school. Mostly, they were asked to go home and talk to their mothers. They also talked about being scared and embarrassed. Now the girls had information and were able to talk openly to other girls regarding menstruation. They are able to ensure that other girls dispose the sanitary pads in a proper manner in the dustbins. The group also discussed issues related to child and early marriage.

In Sitaram Nagar, a Sambal Kishori Samoo has been formed recently. According to the girls all women as well as adolescent girls use sanitary pads.

Though the forum is new, girls feel free to speak about menstrual health. They have attended training at Indiana Hotel, Jaipur as well as celebrated Menstrual Day (*Mahawari Diwas*) on May 28. They stated that MH day is celebrated on May 28 every year. The date was significant as it denotes the menstrual cycle which falls after 28 days and the 5<sup>th</sup> month is easy to remember as usually lasts for 5 days. In the meeting they discussed and tried to dispel the myths and taboos surrounding menstruation. The girls said that no restrictions were imposed in their homes during their periods. They cooked and ate with everyone and did not miss school. Pads were available in the *Anganwadi* or in the school. They did not throw the pads in the open but wrapped them in paper and threw them in the garbage bin.

In Parvat Colony, the forum was quite newly formed, when the assessing team met with them. The forum had about ten girls as members of which some were still in school while some had dropped out. The group has had three meetings till now under the guidance of CFAR. The girls have participated in two trainings; have observed the MH day and attended meetings on menstrual health and hygiene.

### **Consultation on Menstrual Hygiene Management**

A Consultation on Menstrual Hygiene Management: Perspectives, Interventions and Challenges, was organised by CFAR in collaboration with IDS, Jaipur on Feb 17, 2017 to provide the community and partner NGOs with an opportunity to share their concerns and experiences on Menstrual Hygiene Management (MHM) in Rajasthan. The main objective of the Consultation was to break the silence around menstruation and evolve strategies to address the issue both at the policy and practice levels. The participants included Principal Secretary, Health and Family welfare, Government of Rajasthan, Deputy Director Women and Child Development, adolescent girls from various colonies, members of women’s forums and NGO partners.

The findings of a study on the efficacy of the Udaan scheme, for Free Sanitary Napkin Distribution launched in 2015 by the Government of Rajasthan carried out by IDSJ were presented. The CFAR team shared how it had linked 19 adolescent forums’ in Jaipur, Jodhpur and Kota with a National Urban Health Mission (NUHM) scheme for mobilizing and generating awareness among girls on MHM. Under the scheme, one girl trains 10 other girls, who in turn trains others; thereby building a network on the issue in urban slums.

The girls from adolescent forums shared the challenges they faced during menstruation and the benefits they received under the UDAAN- scheme. There was consensus on the need to break stereotypes and the stigma attached to menstruation which is forcing women to perceive their bodies as inferior and unclean. It was also felt that just providing the menstrual absorbent does not ensure comfort. It needs to be complimented by other facilities like water, clean toilets and private space to change. Girls should be enabled to make an informed choice between different menstrual absorbents depending upon what suits their comfort.

The Principal Secretary Health and Family Welfare stated that the Health Department supports the need to regularize the scheme both in rural and urban areas. Presently, there is a mismatch between demand and supply and there are also budgetary constraints. She reiterated the need for convergence between the three concerned Departments viz. Health, Women and Child Development and Education for mainstreaming of MHM. She further stated that since NUHM is a separate unit under NHM, the concept of Adolescent Clinics could be included in its annual Programme Implementation Plan.

*Source: report on Consultation on Menstrual Hygiene Management: Perspectives, Interventions and Challenges, Feb 17, 2017*

### **Role of Men and Boys**

#### **Engaging with men and boys has been a challenging part of community engagement and requires continuous efforts.**

In all the intervention areas, efforts have been made to involve men and boys in various activities. The FGD with men and boys at Soot Mill Colony revealed that they were aware that CFAR was working with the women as well as adolescent girls' in their *basti* for a number of years on issues pertaining to sanitation, health and clean drinking water. They felt that CFAR had been instrumental in creating awareness among women to form a group so that they are able to tackle their problems and find solutions to them. The women were also members of *Mahila Arogya Samiti* and were creating awareness among the community on issues regarding cleanliness and sanitation of their *basti*. Some of the men were involved in construction of twin-pit toilets in other people's homes, and some men had constructed the toilets in their own homes.

The men were aware that some women of *Mahila Arogya Samiti* and *Jagriti Mahila Samooh* were taken for an exposure visit to Bikaner in 2013 and given training in the construction of twin pit toilets. They were also given information and training on waste management (garbage segregation).

The men said that in 2015, the women's forum, with the help of CFAR, had submitted an application to the Nagar Nigam to hold a camp in their *basti* for building toilets under the SBA scheme. The forms were submitted by various households with the guidance of the women's forum and CFAR. The JEN as well as AEN with the commissioner and other officers of that area had participated in the camp. Around 300 families submitted their applications between November and December 2015 with the necessary documents such as photocopies of ration card, Aadhar card, and the front page of bank pass book...

Out of the 300 applications, 263 forms were found to be complete and the first instalment was released to around 240 applicants. The government agreed to give Rs 12000/- in three instalments for the construction of toilets. Construction work started after they received the first instalment. In a training workshop organised by CFAR, apart from community members, masons and labourers who were to help build the toilets were also invited. Women were also included in this training. Information regarding the usefulness of these toilets was also shared. CFAR workers supervised the construction of the toilets in three households, while in others, members of *Mahila Arogya Samiti*, *Daksha Samooh* as well as other CFAR members provided guidance.

The advantages of twin pit toilets, enumerated by men were as follows:

- ⊙ Constructing twin-pit toilets was easy and simple. Many masons and laborers had built the toilets in their own homes and saved on labour costs. The pits were not too deep; hence they were cheaper to build. The cost of pipes, bricks and the seat were also cheaper.

- ⊙ It required less space. Only one chamber was sufficient. Once the pit was full, it is ready to be reused again after some time. The water does not have to be removed as it dries up with time.
- ⊙ It was easily affordable by all income groups.
- ⊙ Having a toilet within their homes had reduced the risk of going for open defecation near the railway tracks which was dangerous.
- ⊙ Women and girls had to face anti- social elements when they went for open defecation.

During the discussion, participants agreed that it was difficult to get a toilet constructed, in the meagre amount provided by the government but it had been possible with CFAR's intervention.

However, construction of toilets was only half the battle; it was a bigger challenge getting the people to use them, the men said. To get the older generation to use the toilets at home was a difficult task. CFAR has helped in educating the people on the usage, maintenance and upkeep of toilets in order to ensure behavioural change. Slight shifts were visible with the community members beginning to use the toilets.

In Jhalana Kunda too, men as well as youth were aware of the initiatives taken by CFAR in involving women of their community in water, sanitation and hygiene issues including construction of IHHL toilets. They said that with the help of CFAR team, the women's forum had written applications to the Nagar Nigam to clean up the drain in the colony. This was followed by regular visits to the Nigam and ultimately the women's forum met with success.

There was acknowledgement of the fact that CFAR had encouraged community members to construct toilets in their households. The organisation had been instrumental in educating the community members about the benefits of using household toilets as opposed to open defecation, the technique of constructing toilets and the costs entailed. The community members had also been informed on proper garbage disposal. The members of the Daksha Samooh in Jhalana Kunda also participated in the training at Bikaner on twin pit toilets. On their return from Bikaner, they were instrumental in getting the Nigam to hold a camp on toilet construction in their basti. This took place in December 2015.

Information about the camp was given to the community members through women's as well as youth forums. During the camp, women as well as adolescents helped in filling out application forms and collecting necessary documents. A few community members, together with CFAR workers visited each block of the *basti*. They gave information as well as trained people on the benefits of twin-pit toilets, on how to construct them and where to procure the materials for construction. Out of the 913 households in the *basti*, around 665 have put in applications for twin-pit toilets out of which 458 (around 70%) had received the first instalment in their bank accounts. By the time the report was compiled, 234 households had also received the second instalment of Rs 4000/- in their accounts. About 70% of the households had already constructed the twin-pit toilets.

Despite the construction of toilets in individual houses, some people still preferred defecating in the open. Women's forum was working actively to stop this, even getting up early just to dissuade people from going out to defecate by telling them of the health hazards. CFAR team gave demonstration on the cleaning of these toilets. This has helped people of the community to keep their toilets clean.

Today most households are aware of the benefits of twin-pit toilets i.e. it is economical and simple to construct, use of water is minimum, does not require specialised technology, doesn't require too much space. Since the pits are not too deep, they are not dangerous and it is not necessary to empty out the pits. For a family of five members, this toilet can function for a minimum of 10 years.

The masons who have been trained by CFAR are helping others in construction of these toilets which in turn is giving momentum to SBA scheme of the government.

The men and youth recognise that the inputs of CFAR in creating women's forum, empowering them through regular trainings and meetings to tackle their problems and seeking solutions has been beneficial for the community. They feel that just as CFAR has helped in construction of toilets, similarly solutions should be arrived at through participative methods for problems related to drinking water, construction of roads and drains etc. Women should also become aware and empowered to deal with issues of alcoholism and violence connected with it.

The men also voiced the need for regular interaction on part of CFAR with the men of the community. They felt that organizations like CFAR should also organize and help with similar techniques in building drains as well as roads.

### **Public Hearing as a platform for strengthening partnerships**

CFAR has used the platform of public hearing to focus attention on a range of problems related to urban sanitation confronting community women and men of underserved settlements. It is a platform that provides the interface between community members and stakeholders of the government departments. It also helps in looking at a problem from different viewpoints to arrive at a solution collectively.

In the 13 *bastis* of seven wards in Jaipur city, a baseline survey to assess resources, needs and problems was completed in the months of May and June, 2016. Based on the baseline survey, a multi stakeholder consultation was organised with JMC and PHED. Findings of the baseline were validated in a meeting with the community members which included both men and women. Key issues related to water, electricity, sanitation and health were identified and recorded. Public hearings were then planned at five locations in the six wards of Jaipur.

Government departments like the JMC, PHED and Electricity Department, Women and Child development Department were represented in the public hearing which was organised with the help of CFAR. Local MLA, Councillor as well as local political representatives were also invited for discussions. The community was represented by the women of Daksha Samooh as well as other community members who raised their specific concerns.

#### **Public Hearing Ward No. 67, Nagtalai North and South, Parvat Colony, February 14, 2017**

Three *bastis* were selected by CFAR from ward no. 67 to work on issues of WSH. All three *bastis* are situated at the base of hills. The key issues which emerged after validating data were related to lack of sewers, clogging of sewer line, supply of dirty water to households, garbage collection and its disposal, and other general issues related to sanitation. These issues were presented in the hearing where officials from the Nagar Nigam, Water and Electricity Departments and the Women and Child Welfare Department participated.

Parvat Colony does not have a pipeline for water. People have bought small pipes and connected their houses with the main pipeline. The pressure of water is not sufficient. Several residents presented their concerns during the public hearing:

**Bhuri Devi, Nagtalai:** "The lanes in the *basti* do not have pipelines. The water does not reach the houses on higher altitude."

**Rehana, Nagtalai:** "Even after we use a pump, water does not reach our houses. The electricity bill is high because of the use of pump. The solution to this issue can be laying pipelines in the lanes too."

The response of the officials who attended the public hearing

**Jagmohan, AEN:** With reference to Parvat Colony, action will be taken when the application for the need of a water pipeline is received. For this we also need an endorsement from the Parshad. In Nagtalai, if a leakage is detected, we will get it fixed soon. We will increase the pressure of water supply so that it reaches the houses situated higher on the hill slope. But, the community also has to take care of usage of water. Care must be taken that the taps in the houses situated on the lower slopes, are closed when not in use. This will ensure that water reaches all the houses in required quantities.

Report on Jan Sunvai Karyakram Ward 67, CFAR

The public hearings have given a platform for members of the community to voice their specific concerns. It has also enabled the officials to hear the problems first hand and respond to them. The women's forum members along with CFAR follow up the commitments made by the officials during the hearing.

### **Training and capacity building of group members**

Training and capacity building of members of women's forums on issues of sanitation and hygiene, menstrual hygiene, communication and solid waste management have been facilitated by CFAR from time to time.

Training on construction and use and maintenance of twin pit toilets was conducted in Bikaner in 2013. Two members of Daksha Samooh, Jaipur, also attended the training workshop. They, in turn trained other women from their community. Men who were involved in masonry work were also trained.

An orientation workshop was organised by CFAR in Jaipur on of January 28-29, 2016. Resource persons from Jaipur, Jodhpur and Kota, who could work as volunteers participated. The main focus of the workshop was to understand the role of peer educators in advocating and strengthening access to sanitation services at local level. This included creating awareness, strengthening community leaders to act as interface between community members and government authorities and behaviour change issues on BUMT (building toilets/use/maintenance and treatment), menstrual hygiene and hand washing.

Recently, several members participated in the training on solid waste management that was held at Hyderabad. The training has helped the women understand issues of garbage disposal. In addition, a knowledge camp on Solid Waste Management and Garbage Segregation, in Sitaram Nagar *basti* was organised on April 7, 2017. A total of 121 women participated in the camp which focussed on:

- ⊙ Types of garbage
- ⊙ Current practices of waste management
- ⊙ Impact on health and environment
- ⊙ Ways and benefits of garbage segregation at the household level
- ⊙ Reduction of waste

The camp resulted in the women's forum signing a resolution for garbage segregation at source.



### **Resolution for Garbage Segregation at Source, signed by the Women's Forum and residents of Sitaram Nagar kuchchi basti**

We, the residents of Sitaram Nagar kuchchi basti, resolve to take the following steps for solid waste management and garbage segregation. Based on the learning from the knowledge camp held on April 7, 2017 in the basti, we resolve to segregate garbage at the household level.

- We will use separate dustbins for collection of organic and inorganic or dry waste
- We will dispose the waste at the depot in two parts, not mixing the two, so that organic waste can be consumed by animals.
- We will reduce waste
- We will reduce garbage at the depot by selling out waste as junk
- In the coming months, we will submit another resolution to JMC through the women's forum, for production of fertilizer from organic waste.
- We also resolve to mobilize, motivate and track other households to segregate waste

A similar Knowledge Camp was organised at Nagtalai *kuchchi basti* on April 13, 2017. Community members of Nagtalai *kuchchi basti*, Parvat Colony as well as Daksha Samooh members participated in the camp. Information on various legal provisions to address sanitation issues were shared in the camp. The camp was held as there was a lack of information on alternate grievance redressal mechanisms when the current practices of approaching Jaipur Municipal Corporation or their ward counsellors failed. On the other hand, the DLSA (District Legal Services Authority) also felt that the community members lacked information on their legal rights. Applications were submitted at the camp to the concerned Divisional Commissioner, JMC, a copy of which was given to DLSA for follow up. The women's forums also learnt that they could approach the 'Lok Adalat' in case of delayed or unsatisfactory response from the government departments.

A camp on IHHL construction, maintenance and grievance redressal under SBA was organized at Soot Mill Colony on April 18, 2017. The camp was organized to assess the current status of toilet construction in households and for creating awareness on the major challenges faced in construction of toilets. For this, the forum acquired the sanctioned list of applicants from the JMC. This was read out to the gathering which enabled several households to know the status of their application.

Kamla Devi, resident, Soot Mill, raised the issue of her subsidy not being released. "I have submitted my application twice, but neither have I received any answer nor have I received my first instalment" It was explained that one of the major reasons for subsidy not being released is discrepancy in information in the application form submitted and the supporting documents viz. difference in name in different documents etc. A list of households whose forms have been accepted was provided by the JMC. (CFAR Report, 2017)

## Section III

### Community Engagement for WSH: Perspective of Government and other stakeholders

The agencies that have played a key role in the development and improvement of underserved urban settlements/ *bastis* in Jaipur are Jaipur Municipal Corporation (JMC), Department of Health and Family Welfare, National Urban Health Mission (NUHM) and City Managers Association Rajasthan (CMAR), Directorate of Local Bodies (DLB). While the primary responsibility lies with the JMC, key roles of creating awareness on health and hygiene have been undertaken by the Department of Health and Family Welfare and NUHM. The CFAR team has been closely working with all these agencies. An effort was made to understand the perspectives of officials from these departments on issues of WSH and the role of CFAR in furthering community engagement. The matter was looked at from the perspective of the civil society organisations who are involved in similar activities. This is discussed in the following section.

#### Jaipur Municipal Corporation

The Jaipur Municipal Corporation has the primary responsibility of ensuring civic services in the urban colonies of Jaipur. According to the Nodal Officer, Swachh Bharat Mission, Jaipur, the JMC is involved in the SBM and monitors the construction of Individual toilets. He stated that the JMC had placed an advertisement inviting NGO participation in SBM. Out of a list of 8-10 NGOs, only CFAR expressed a willingness to collaborate. He appreciated CFAR's role in raising awareness regarding open defecation and facilitating the construction of toilets in their intervention areas which led to the construction of 400 toilets in Jhalana Kunda *basti* and 220 in Soot Mill Colony. Training on twin pit toilets was also organized by CFAR and the organisation started working in Jawahar Nagar at the request of JMC.

The nodal officer said that the JMC's target was to make Jaipur free of open defecation by December 2017. The government can help people in construction of toilets. While there is no limit to the number of toilets that can be constructed, the problem of open defecation was primarily due to lack of space for constructing toilets and reluctance of people to use them even when they were constructed. In some areas like MNIT *kucchi basti*, and some pockets of Jawahar Nagar, the construction of toilets had been problematic. This was because of lack of space/land. In these areas, the land belonged to the forest department and permission had to be sought from them.

Commenting on the availability of public toilets, the nodal officer gave the example of Jawahar Nagar bypass road, where six public toilets had been constructed. However, maintenance of these toilets was a big issue. Taps were stolen and needed to be replaced almost daily. Despite inviting tenders for maintenance of the public toilets in the city, the JMC had not received any positive response. He emphasized that the community should take the onus of maintenance of toilets, but for that they had to become aware and sensitive to usage and cleanliness issues.

On FSSM, he said that JMC was making a detailed plan and would be putting a monitoring system in place. However, laying sewer lines in slum areas was not easy and needed policy level interventions, he said.

The JMC official appreciated the efforts made by CFAR in raising awareness and helping in changing sanitation practices. He also underscored that the JMC was keen that CFAR takes responsibility of urban sanitation in more areas. According to him: *“CFAR had helped in verifying applications; monitored the construction of toilets and helped upload the photos of constructed toilets so that the second instalment could be disbursed to the families in Jhalana Kunda. Similar efforts by the CFAR team in other bastis would be immensely helpful in furthering the mandate of the SBM”*.

Discussions with the Junior Engineer, JMC, who was earlier posted in the Moti Dungri zone, pointed out that CFAR carried out a survey in the Jhalana Kunda settlement and motivated the community members to build toilets. They also supervised the construction work and this resulted in the construction of 400 toilets.

According to the Junior Engineer of the municipality, JMC does not have any extra staff for SBM although each JEN had been given the task of making one ward open-defecation free by December 2017. He said, CFAR should take on a formal role, perhaps as consultants, of helping the JMC.

### **Department of Health and Family Welfare and NUHM**

CFAR has been collaborating with the Department of Health and Family Welfare and NUHM since 2012. However, as one of the consultants pointed out, there was a need to converge the many departments - Local bodies, ICDS, SBM, livelihood Mission, health and education department on issues of urban poor. She asserted that while there was no formal partnership/MOU between CFAR and NUHM, there was mutual understanding and cooperation. The NUHM and CFAR have worked in close coordination. There are 800 Mahila Arogya Samitis (MAS) in Jaipur city and many of the MAS leaders are also part of the CFAR group/forums. CFAR has also helped in the training of MAS members and conducted a session on WSH issues in the training. Some of the MAS members are also appointed as *Swachhta Grahis*.

Another Consultant, NUHM, stated that creating awareness among the community members about issues of WSH was of great importance. According to her, community should be able to understand their own needs and problems. The community should ensure the use and maintenance of the toilets that have been constructed. Like CFAR, other community organizations should also be involved and good practices should be replicated in other colonies too.

The CMHO, Jaipur, appreciated the role played by the members of women's forums who are also members of MAS. He pointed out that MAS is a bridge between the government and the people. MAS is responsible for public health care and creating awareness amongst the community on health issues and ways of availing public health services. It is represented by ASHA. One ASHA is appointed on every 1000 people, each one surveying at least 10 households per day. MAS activities have to be linked to urban sanitation which is a very important aspect of health. Through MAS which can act as liaison between people and the government, '*bachaav, upchaar and niyantran*' of public health can be implemented.

### **City Managers Association Rajasthan, Directorate of Local Bodies (DLB)**

The DLB has also been supporting many of the activities undertaken by CFAR in the intervention areas. The Coordinator, CMAR (DLB) was of the view that the 'single window' approach which is to be piloted by CFAR will help arrive at solutions to the problems faced by the marginalised community. The "single window" would also help in the convergence of CFAR, MAS and government departments like JMC, PHED, DW and CD etc. After the pilot in Jaipur, it will be introduced in Jodhpur and Kota.

### **Civil Society Organisations**

CFAR has been networking with several civil society organisations and individuals in furthering the cause of urban sanitation in the intervention areas. Following is a brief note on the Consultation on Single window approach organised by CFAR:

#### **A Multi-Stake Holder Consultation on Converging Sanitation Services for Marginalised Communities through Single Window, Jaipur on July 13, 2017.**

The consultation aimed to create a shared understanding and perspective about the 'Single Window' or one stop centre approach to urban sanitation. It addressed diverse concerns of the

community to avail sanitation related schemes and strengthen behaviour change. The objective was to develop its scope and priorities and evolve a capacity building plan for community volunteers to make the Single Window efficient.

The Consultation brought together diverse stakeholders which included Nodal officer, SBM, AEn, JMC, Coordinator, CMAR (DLB), CMHO, Department of Health, NUHM; experts from civil society organizations and academia and representatives of Daksha Samooh and grassroots collectives such as Women's Forum.

All stakeholders asserted that the concept and approach of Single Window was an important one. The government officials were unanimous in appreciating the initiative. However, the Nodal Officer JMC reiterated that while the government can get a large number of toilets constructed; the onus of using and maintaining the toilets is on the community members. The NUHM representatives reiterated the important role of MAS in acting as a bridge between the government and the community. The CMAR, DLB coordinator asserted that a single window would help in creating the much-needed convergence between CFAR, MAS and other government departments.

#### **Discussions were held with some of the civil society organisations during the consultation:**

- ◆ **Priyanka Sharma, freelance sanitation expert:** She said that in SBM rural, payment of advance money to build toilets was discontinued in 2013-14. If money as well as the model for building toilets was given by the government or an organization, then the onus of building toilets was on the organization, rather than on the beneficiaries. This model, according to her, was not successful. She said behaviour change should come before actually building the toilets '*shauchalaya pehle dimaag mein*' (behaviour change can be brought about through 'triggering' the idea of a toilet). The funds should be given later, not for the construction of toilets but for its use and maintenance. It should be more as prize money. Responsibility and ownership should both be with the community.
- ◆ **Renu Sharma, Parivar Sewa Sansthan:** She also agreed that money should not be given before the construction and that awareness of the need should come before actually building them. According to her, at present people feel that SBM is disbursing money, so it should be taken. Whether the toilets will be used or not is not important. She suggested that more emphasis should be given to monitoring the scheme.
- ◆ **Praveer Goyal from MAMTA who was associated with SBM in rural areas emphasized that** more work should be done with the community towards behaviour change. He suggested that:
  - Empty plots that tend to become grounds for garbage disposal should either be sold or cleared for construction work.
  - Standard IEC material should be developed to spread the message of urban sanitation
  - Support should be taken from the private sector and they should be motivated to initiate **CSR funds for community** development, which could include sanitation as well as other issues. **qwerty**
  - Building IHHL toilets is only one of the issues in the larger schema of urban sanitation. Several other issues like sewer lines, garbage disposal, and clean drinking water are other issues that need to be addressed.

It was asserted during the Consultation that a combined plan was required for a single window which would mean convergence of different departments. A single point window is a move towards the sustainability of different schemes.

## Section IV

### Assessing Gains and Challenges in Community Engagement for WSH

As is evident from the previous sections, community engagement in the CFAR intervention areas has been facilitated through the Daksha Samooh, women's forums, adolescent forums and various platforms like public hearing and knowledge camps that have provided opportunities for interface between community and government officials. This Section provides an insight into the gains made and some of the challenges that need to be addressed.

#### Gains and Impact of the project

##### Enabling an understanding on WSH issues

CFAR has been successful in making the WSH concerns central to the lives of the community women. It has ensured participatory involvement of women and enabled them to recognize these needs. They have begun to raise their voice, seek help from CFAR members and local leaders and actively work towards having their voices heard to solve problems. This has been achieved through creation of four platforms:

- Women's forums, Daksha Samooh, Adolescent girls' groups and Men's groups- The women's forum and the Daksha Samooh meet at least once a month and discuss issues related to sanitation, cleanliness and hygiene. Though the men's forum is not very active, their level of understanding has increased through the efforts made by women. This has helped in enhancing men's cooperation and they are now more supportive of the work done by women.
- Public hearings have given a platform for members of the community to voice their specific concerns. It has also enabled the officials to hear the problems first hand and respond to them.
- Knowledge Camps- where resource persons and experts are invited to speak on various issues of WSH; to help disseminate information and increase understanding of issues
- Exposure visits and training programs- Training on construction of two pit toilets at Bikaner has been a major learning experience and has helped the women construct toilets in individual households. Training on solid waste management at ASCI, Hyderabad has given an insight into garbage disposal. Efforts have also been made to make women aware about various aspects of FSSM.

CFAR intervention has not only succeeded in generating awareness regarding the various government programmes, but also with regard to the rights of cluster residents.

Women's forums are addressing domestic violence in their community. They try and intervene through counselling both the victim and the perpetrator. In case they do not succeed, they reach out to the Mahila Thana, Mahila Suraksha Kendra or the Aparajita (One Stop Crisis Centre) in Jaipur.

##### Promoting Behaviour Change

The exposure provided by CFAR in dealing with officials has empowered the women to face challenging situations. They are now articulate and confident. The change in their self-esteem has also led to a change in their social image and the people of other *bastis* including men now contact the women's forum to get work done in government departments. According to Maya, a Daksha

SamooH representative in Jhalana Kunda "the Nagar Nigam would not have been successful in achieving goals of SBM but for the effort of the women's forum in creating awareness on the issue among community members".

Some of the key areas where change is discernible are as follows:

- Use of toilets: In all the four *bastis* that the assessing team visited, nearly all the houses have toilets. The women have made an effort to stop those who still go for open defecation.
- Water: There is a growing realization regarding importance of clean drinking water, appropriate storage facilities, cleaning of containers and using proper methods to prevent contamination.

In JhalanaKunda cluster, CFAR members organised a health camp where people were given information about water-borne diseases and the importance of clean drinking water. Women said that in most households long handled ladles were used to take out water from the storage vessels.

- Garbage disposal: Consciousness regarding garbage disposal and efforts to keep drains clean is visible in almost all the surveyed areas. In Sitaram Nagar, each household collects garbage in a bucket. The women have knowledge about segregation of waste. Some of the households have been provided the blue and green bins by the government and some by CFAR. In Soot Mill Colony, the Daksha SamooH is now a recognized body by the DLB. The '*safai karamchari*' has to get the register signed by a member of the Daksha SamooH before submitting it in the office.
- Menstrual Hygiene: Girls and women have started using sanitary napkins and have adopted hygienic practices. They are aware of the 'good' practices in disposal of used napkins. There has been a slackening of socio-religious taboos associated with menstruation. Girls are able to articulate and speak up on menstrual health with family members. In Sitaram Nagar the girls said that there is no taboo in their homes during periods. They cook, eat with everyone and try not to miss school.
- Education: Nearly all children in these *bastis* attend school. In Sitaram Nagar, the women's forum is encouraging women and girls who had to drop out of school, to continue with their education through open schooling. Phoranti, *the leader of the women's forum*, has passed class X through the State open school and is a leading example.

### **Ensuring Infrastructure and services for WSH**

With support from CFAR, the women's forums have enabled several changes in both the infrastructure and services for WSH. This has been achieved through engaging with the Government and through self-effort. Some of the significant changes are as follows:

#### **Toilets and Sanitation**

As seen earlier the twin pit dry latrines which require less water and are easy to manage have been well received by the community. Technical and financial support has enabled people to build personal toilets. CFAR has worked with the government functionaries in identifying beneficiaries in various slums and helped them filling the forms for construction of toilets under Swachh Bharat Mission. This initiative has been successfully linked with mission at the state level. It is a replicable model. The demand for community toilets raised by the women's forum in Soot Mill Colony and single seat- pre fabricated toilets have now been provided for the colony.

## **Garbage collection and disposal**

Before the intervention, services for collection and disposal of garbage were lacking and garbage was often strewn in the lanes of the colony. However, there has been a change since then, municipality has organised for the garbage to be collected from the households or from some fixed designated place in the slums.

The open garbage depot in Sitaram Nagar has been made '*pucca*'. In Soot Mill Colony also, the forum has made an effort to procure a garbage disposal bin from the government.

## **Drains**

Today the people in some clusters understand the importance of cleanliness and have started cleaning the drains themselves. In Jhalana Kunda cluster, the intervention by CFAR led to several improvements: the big drain was cleaned; a pucca road was constructed in the cluster; and people also managed to get small drains constructed in front of their houses. These small drains were then connected to the big drain, solving the problem of water-logging.

In Soot Mill Colony, community toilets are being constructed for people who are living as tenants since there is no provision for disbursing money to tenants for constructing toilets under the SBM. Also, as there were no '*pucca*' drains to let out the water after bathing and washing clothes the residents built a 20-foot soak pit in front of each house.

## **Water**

The women's forum in Soot Mill Colony collected money and bought the necessary equipment i.e. pipes, motor pump (which cost around Rs.3500-4000) etc. so that each lane could have at least one water connection. Now there are about eight taps in the *basti*, roughly one in each lane. There are some taps in individual homes too.

## **Roads**

In Jhalana Kunda, the women's forum was able to negotiate with the contractor to procure the materials needed for constructing roads. The members of the community were successful in making the lanes of the *basti* '*pucca*'.

## **Building Partnerships**

A successful partnership has been established between the NUHM through the *Mahila Arogya Samitis*. The samitis are working on issues of health, sanitation, prevention of diseases and access to government schemes. Similarly, partnership between CFAR and SBM through JMC has helped ensure construction of toilets as well as spread awareness regarding filling of application forms etc.

## **Addressing problems**

CFAR has played an important role by helping communities to file written complaints to the concerned authorities. The women are now empowered and have gained confidence to approach the right people.

Three years back, the Jhalana Kunda cluster suffered from problems of inadequate and impure water. The problems would aggravate during the summers, resulting in fights among people within and outside the cluster as people had to fetch water from various places outside the slums. People of the cluster visited various offices several times to file complaints, but to no effect. Once, they even resorted to blocking the road in protest against the inaction by the authorities. CFAR helped the women's group in solving this problem by teaching them how to

file complaints/ applications. The group members went to meet the officials of the Jal Board and the Parshad of the area. After repeated requests, two tube wells were installed and connected to the water tank; in the cluster.

Source : Sanitation, Water and Hygiene: Strengthening Community Centred and Gender Responsive Provisioning, IHD, 2017

The various instances of community engagement discussed above indicate that the processes initiated by CFAR have led to change at different levels. Overall services in the *bastis* have improved. The forums are actively pursuing issues of sanitation as well as other social issues. The response of government officials is also favourable and opportunities of collaboration have been optimised.

### **Challenges in engaging communities on WSH**

While the training and construction of twin pit toilets has led to CFAR gaining trust among the community women and men as well as government officials, several challenges remain to be addressed.

Establishing trust and rapport with those members of the community who are not part of the women's forums is difficult. This is also essential especially in the context of behaviour change. Breaking through set habit patterns of community members is also challenging as despite having toilets at home some members continue to go for open defecation.

Motivating men to get involved in issues of WSH is an area that requires sustained effort. Though the men have become aware of the work done by the women's forum and appreciate it, they have not taken any initiative to form a collective and take up issues concerning the community. While some (45) masons were trained in twin pit toilet technique, other men assert that they are preoccupied with earning a livelihood and therefore do not have time for meetings or trainings. A conscious effort to elicit participation of men, on all aspects of urban sanitation needs to be put in place, more so in the newer intervention areas.

Engaging with government officials is very important for the success of the intervention. However, the women's forum members complained that by the time rapport is established between the community members and government officials and there is some understanding of the issues, the officials are transferred. A lot of time and energy is spent in explaining the problem with newly appointed officials.

While the women members are confident to interact with government officials it is evident that the women have to make several visits to government offices to get the work done. They have to deal with a lot of red tape. Even the smallest task may sometimes take several hours or days. This often impacts the women adversely as it is at the cost of a day's earnings or neglecting household chores. At times, the men jeer at them, calling them *e Netanis!* In addition, constant reminders and follow up is required with the government officials. In Parvat Colony, the assessing team saw garbage thrown in a large pit outside the colony. It was supposed to be taken away by the Nagar Nigam, but no action had been taken. Promises and commitments made during the public hearings also need to be followed up.

The women who have received training on solid waste management and segregation of household waste make an effort to segregate the garbage at the individual household level. Unfortunately, the garbage collection van of the Nagar Nigam does not segregate the waste. Hence, it is a wasted effort on the part of the women.



Alcohol and related domestic violence is also a major problem. In Soot Mill colony, the forum has even tried to remove the illicit liquor shops run by a female vendor as they are distressed to see their men and young boys getting addicted to alcohol. In 2011, they had gone to the extent of burning down the shop. The shop has been constructed again on the land belonging to the railway department. The forum feels that now they have no control over the situation. Only if the railway officers cooperate can any action be taken. It has become difficult for them to try and remove it. The men continue to buy liquor from the shop.

There has been no discussion within CFAR on the withdrawal strategy in the project and the mechanisms that need to be put in place to ensure sustainability of the interventions. This needs to be clearly articulated and understood by all concerned.

## Section V

### Conclusion and Way Forward

This mid-line assessment of the CFAR intervention in Jaipur has focused on understanding the key processes that have enabled community engagement on WSH issues, the successes and remaining challenges.

Primarily the intervention has centred on strengthening various community forums and platforms and facilitated sustained engagement with government stakeholders and service providers. The discussions also indicate that processes initiated by CFAR have been well received and the mature groups have taken up many issues. There is evidence of strong leadership among women. They have negotiated gender boundaries and have worked collectively towards improving their surroundings. Women also acknowledge that they have gained knowledge and experience by being part of the forums. The nascent groups, however, need continuous inputs on different aspects of gender and WSH, to enable them to take up issues with confidence. The response of the various government partners and officials has been extremely positive and can be seen as strength of the approach adopted by CFAR. Further it is envisaged that new interventions like Single window approach would help strengthen the collaboration between community and service providers as well as improve convergence.

Given the intensity of the work and continuing challenges, some of the recommendations that flow from the midline assessment are:

- There is a need for in-depth and extensive engagement with Women's Forums in new areas that are at a nascent stage. Regular visits and handholding by members of the Daksha Samooh and mature groups can help in strengthening these groups.
- Systematic training and capacity building of members of Women's Forum on gender issues is essential. This is necessary to understand the different dimensions of gender subordination and its relation to access to resources and entitlements. The groups also demanded that training on livelihoods and skill building should be organized for women and girls.
- The demand for literacy centers was also raised by women in various colonies as older women were keen to gain literacy skills. Linkages with concerned department would help in addressing this issue.
- The involvement of men and boys in the intervention areas is an aspect that needs to be strengthened. Regular interaction with them would enable their participation in activities and on issues of urban sanitation. This will also help dispel the perception that urban sanitation is a "women's issue".
- While a good rapport has been established by CFAR with various government officials at the field level, it would be helpful if there is engagement with senior officials in the JMC, DLB and NUHM. This would also help in streamlining convergence between these agencies and enable coordinated efforts.
- Gender training of CFAR personnel on linkages between urban sanitation and gender emerges as a critical area.

- CFARs recent initiative of establishing a 'Single Window as a platform for convergence between community and government' is a positive step as it envisages convergence of all the stakeholders. Once implemented this needs to be monitored closely.
- The Community Score Card being developed by CFAR is a positive intervention. However, the purpose of rating and its outcomes needs to be clearly understood by CFAR team as well as community women and men
- Finally, CFAR needs to discuss the withdrawal strategy both within the organization and in the communities in which they are working so that appropriate mechanisms can be put in place at the community level.





**Institute of Development Studies Jaipur**  
(Supported by ICSSR, New Delhi)